

**Pharmacy Benefit Manager  
 Solicitation No. 2015-7755  
 Comparison of Solicitation Proposals**

The objective of the Solicitation is to gain an understanding of firm's ability to provide the services as specified in Exhibit 3, PBM Model Contract and Exhibit 4, PBM Contractor's Manual. The firms' responses were evaluated through a consensus scoring process. The qualitative portions were determined by how well each firms' response demonstrated a clear understanding of the intent and requirements of the Solicitation and their ability to meet the requirements. The quantitative portions of the Financial Plan included Cost Projections and Performance Measures and were based upon the actual pricing terms and Administrative Service Fees (ASF) at risk i.e., the lowest cost on pricing terms received the highest value and the most dollars at risk received the highest value. After the initial staff review, evaluation and consensus scoring were completed, CalPERS conducted two rounds of clarifications that included:

- Improvements on financial terms
- Clarification on retail network for the mail at retail programs
- Detail on formulary disruption – impact to benefits tier and Prior Authorization/Utilization Management programs
- Clarifications on clinical programs and program savings.

**Overall Summary Results:**

Based on the initial review and the four rounds of clarifications, the three firms have all demonstrated that they can provide the services requested at competitive pricing. Overall responses for Firm's Capabilities, Work Plan, Management Plan, Staffing Plan and Financial Plan were scaled and weighted as follows:

SOLICITATION ATTACHMENTS	CVS	ESI	Optum
Firm's Capabilities	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
Management Plan	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
Work Plan	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
Staffing Plan	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
Financial Plan - All Other	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
Financial Plan - Performance Measures	★★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
Financial Plan - Cost Projections	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★★
<b>Overall Total</b>	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★

**Pharmacy Benefit Manager  
 Solicitation No. 2015-7755  
 Comparison of Solicitation Proposals**

**Firm's Capabilities**

The object is to understand the firm's current capabilities and future vision around managing and driving all aspect of the PBM services. All responses were evaluated. The areas weighted the most were Member Engagement Strategies and Innovation Strategies. At the next level of importance were Network Drivers, Plan Design, Prescribing Edits, and Strategic Vision. Below is a summary of the results:

	<b>FIRM'S CAPABILITIES</b>	<b>CVS</b>	<b>ESI</b>	<b>Optum</b>
A	History			
B	Formulary Control			
C	Network Drivers	★★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
D	Plan Design	★★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
E	Prescribing Edits (PA, QL, ST)	★★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
F	Strategic Vision	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
G	Pharmaceutical Revenue & Cost	★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
H	Member Engagement Strategies	★★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
I	Prescriber Engagement Strategies	★★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
J	Stakeholder Engagement Strategies	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
K	Innovation Strategies	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
L	Pharmaceutical Manufacturers	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
M	Flexibility	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
N	External Factors	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
O	Other			
	<b>Overall Total</b>	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★

**Pharmacy Benefit Manager  
 Solicitation No. 2015-7755  
 Comparison of Solicitation Proposals**

**Management Plan**

All responses were evaluated. The areas weighted the most were Pricing, Payments, and Guarantees, Pharmacy Benefits, and Systems and Data Reporting Management. At the next level of importance were Member Services, Pharmacy Provider Network, Medicare Plans, Administrative and Account Management Support. Below is a summary of the results:

<b>Contract Section (Attachment A)</b>	<b>MANAGEMENT PLAN</b>	<b>CVS</b>	<b>ESI</b>	<b>Optum</b>
A	Administrative and Account Management Support	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
B	Eligibility and Enrollment	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
C	Member Services	★★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
D	Pricing, Payments, and Guarantees	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
E	Fraud, Waste, and Abuse Detection/Prevention Services	★★★	★★★★	★★★★★
F	Claims Administration	★★★	★★★	★★★★
G	Systems and Data Reporting Management	★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
H	Pharmacy Provider Network	★★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
I	Medical Management Services	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
J	Health and Disease Management	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
K	Pharmacy Benefits	★★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
L	Integrated Healthcare Model (IHM)	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
M	Medicare Plans	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
N	Innovations	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
O	Exit Transition	★★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
	<b>Overall Total</b>	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★

**Pharmacy Benefit Manager  
 Solicitation No. 2015-7755  
 Comparison of Solicitation Proposals**

**Work Plan**

All responses were evaluated. The areas weighted the most were Pharmacy Benefits, Systems and Data Reporting Management, Pharmacy Provider Network, Medicare Plans. At the next level of importance were Member Services, Claims Administration, Medical Management Services, Administrative and Account Management. Below is a summary of the results:

<b>Contract Section (Attachment A)</b>	<b>WORK PLAN</b>	<b>CVS</b>	<b>ESI</b>	<b>Optum</b>
A	Administrative and Account Management Support	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
B	Eligibility and Enrollment	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
C	Member Services	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
D	Pricing, Payments, and Guarantees			
E	Fraud, Waste, and Abuse Detection/Prevention Services	★★★	★★★★	★★★★★
F	Claims Administration	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
G	Systems and Data Reporting Management	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
H	Pharmacy Provider Network	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★★
I	Medical Management Services	★★	★★★	★★★★
J	Health and Disease Management	★★★	★★★	★★★
K	Pharmacy Benefits	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
L	Integrated Healthcare Model (IHM)	★★★	★★★	★★★★
M	Medicare Plans	★★★	★★★	★★★
N	Innovations	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
O	Exit Transition			
	<b>Overall Total</b>	★★★	★★★★	★★★★

**Pharmacy Benefit Manager  
Solicitation No. 2015-7755  
Comparison of Solicitation Proposals**

**Staffing Plan**

The objective was to understand a firms staffing commitment to fulfill all requirements. All responses were evaluated. Most of the areas were given equal importance. Below is a summary of the results.

<b>Contract Section (Attachment A)</b>	<b>STAFFING PLAN</b>	<b>CVS</b>	<b>ESI</b>	<b>Optum</b>
A	Administrative and Account Management Support	★★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
B	Eligibility and Enrollment	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
C	Member Services	★★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★
D	Pricing, Payments, and Guarantees	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
E	Fraud, Waste, and Abuse Detection/Prevention Services	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
F	Claims Administration	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
G	Systems and Data Reporting Management	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
H	Pharmacy Provider Network	★★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
I	Medical Management Services	★★★	★★★	★★★★
J	Health and Disease Management	★★★	★★★	★★★★
K	Pharmacy Benefits	★★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
L	Integrated Healthcare Model (IHM)	★★★	★★★	★★★
M	Medicare Plans	★★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
N	Innovations	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
O	Exit Transition			
	<b>Overall Total</b>	★★★	★★★★	★★★★

**Pharmacy Benefit Manager  
 Solicitation No. 2015-7755  
 Comparison of Solicitation Proposals**

**Financial Plan: All Other:**

These are focused on financial terms that directly impact pricing. All responses were evaluated. The areas weighted the most were Trend Guarantee and Rebate Payments and Formulary. At the next level of importance were Generic Drug Dispensing Rates (GDR) Guarantees and Generic Substitution Rate (GSR) Guarantee. Below is a summary of the results.

	<b>FINANCIAL PLAN</b>	<b>CVS</b>	<b>ESI</b>	<b>Optum</b>
A	Pricing Source			
B	Pricing	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
C	Generic Drug Dispensing Rate (GDR) Guarantees	★★★	★★★★	★★★★
D	Generic Substitution Rate (GSR) Guarantee	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
E	Trend Guarantee	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
F	Rebate Payments & Formulary	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★
G	Clinical Program Savings and Reporting	★★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
H	Administrative Service Fees	★★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
I	Clinical Program Fees (Optional)	★★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
J	AWP Pricing (Basic Plans)	★★★★★	★★★★★	★★★★★
K	AWP Pricing (Medicare Plans EGWP)			
L	Alternative Pricing Proposal (Optional)			
	<b>Overall Total</b>	★★★★	★★★★	★★★★