



Board of Administration Agenda Item 8f

March 16, 2016

Item Name: Proposed Decision – In the Matter of the Cancellation of the Application for Disability Retirement of Anthony Navarro by JENNIFER NAVARRO, Claimant, and CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTIONS AND REHABILITATION, PELICAN BAY STATE PRISON, Respondent.

Program: Benefit Services Division

Item Type: Action

Parties' Positions

Staff argues that the Board of Administration should adopt the Proposed Decision, as modified.

Respondent Jennifer Navarro (Respondent Navarro) argues that the Board of Administration should decline to adopt the Proposed Decision.

Strategic Plan

This item is not a specific product of either the Strategic or Annual Plans. The determination of administrative appeals is a power reserved to the Board of Administration.

Procedural Summary

Anthony Navarro (Decedent) submitted an application for Industrial Disability Retirement on the basis of a back and neck injury that occurred on February 7, 2012, and workplace anxiety. CalPERS denied the application for Industrial Disability Retirement because Decedent had been dismissed from his employment for reasons which were not the result of a disabling medical condition pursuant to *Haywood v. American River Fire Protection District*. Decedent died on or about February 17, 2014. Respondent Navarro has a community property interest in Decedent's retirement and therefore became a party to the action following Decedent's death. Respondent Navarro appealed CalPERS' determination and the matter was heard by the Office of Administrative Hearings on November 10, 2015. A Proposed Decision was issued on January 19, 2016, denying the application for Industrial Disability Retirement.

Alternatives

- A. For use if the Board decides to modify and adopt the Proposed Decision as its own Decision:

RESOLVED, that the Board of Administration of the California Public Employees' Retirement System, pursuant to Government Code section 11517(c)(2)(C), which

authorizes the Board to “make technical or other minor changes in the proposed decision”, hereby modifies the Proposed Decision, by inserting the word “Industrial” before the words “disability retirement in the pleading caption on page one; and by replacing the abbreviation “IDL” with the abbreviation “IDR” on page two and three in the “Disposition of Contentions” subsection, paragraph three; on page eleven, paragraph six, on page fifteen, paragraph sixteen; and hereby adopts as its own Decision the Proposed Decision dated January 19, 2016, concerning the appeal of Jennifer Navarro; RESOLVED FURTHER that this Board Decision shall be effective 30 days following mailing of the Decision.

- B. For use if the Board decides to adopt the Proposed Decision as its own Decision:

RESOLVED, that the Board of Administration of the California Public Employees' Retirement System hereby adopts as its own Decision the Proposed Decision dated January 19, 2016, concerning the appeal of Jennifer Navarro; RESOLVED FURTHER that this Board Decision shall be effective 30 days following the mailing of the Decision.

- C. For use if the Board decides not to adopt the Proposed Decision, and to decide the case upon the record:

RESOLVED, that the Board of Administration of the California Public Employees' Retirement System, after consideration of the Proposed Decision dated January 19, 2016, concerning the appeal of Jennifer Navarro, hereby rejects the Proposed Decision and determines to decide the matter itself, based upon the record produced before the Administrative Law Judge and such additional evidence and arguments that are presented by the parties and accepted by the Board; RESOLVED FURTHER that the Board's Decision shall be made after notice is given to all parties.

- D. For use if the Board decides to remand the matter back to the Office of Administrative Hearings for the taking of further evidence:

RESOLVED, that the Board of Administration of the California Public Employees' Retirement System, after consideration of the Proposed Decision dated January 19, 2016, concerning the appeal of Jennifer Navarro, hereby rejects the Proposed Decision and refers the matter back to the Administrative Law Judge for the taking of additional evidence as specified by the Board at its meeting.

- E. Precedential Nature of Decision (two alternatives; either may be used):

1. For use if the Board wants further argument on the issue of whether to designate its Decision as precedential:

RESOLVED, that the Board of Administration of the California Public Employees' Retirement System requests the parties in the matter concerning the appeal of Jennifer Navarro, as well as interested parties, to submit written argument regarding whether the Board's Decision in this matter should be designated as precedential, and that the Board will consider the issue whether to designate its Decision as precedential at a time to be determined.

2. For use if the Board decides to designate its Decision as precedential, without further argument from the parties.

RESOLVED, that the Board of Administration of the California Public Employees' Retirement System, hereby designates as precedential its Decision concerning the appeal of Jennifer Navarro.

Budget and Fiscal Impacts: Not applicable

Attachments

- Attachment A: Proposed Decision
- Attachment B: Staff's Argument
- Attachment C: Respondent(s) Argument(s)

DONNA RAMEL LUM
Deputy Executive Officer
Customer Services and Support