



Date: January 30, 2016

To: Members of the Investment Committee
California Public Employees' Retirement System

From: Pension Consulting Alliance, Inc. (PCA)

RE: Real Estate Performance through December 31, 2015

PCA received and reviewed Wilshire's Executive Summary of CalPERS' Investment Performance for the period ending December 31, 2015 as it relates to the Real Estate Portfolio. The following items should be considered in your assessment of Real Estate's performance:

Real Estate Market:

- In general, the North American commercial real estate markets continue to display improving fundamentals insofar as occupancy demand and increases in net rental rates. These rates of increase are approaching historical averages. The benefits associated with this increased pace are partially derived from below average new construction levels (with the exception of multifamily residential) and historically low base rates for mortgage loans. As demand firms, and construction lenders ease underwriting criteria (which often happens when there is insufficient other profitable lending activity, and appears to be occurring), new construction will increase. It is likely that capital market interest rate increases, as initiated by the Federal Reserve, will gradually continue during the next twelve to twenty four months. This will eventually translate into higher capitalization rates, which will reduce valuations if property level net income, fueled by higher rents and increased demand for space, does not also increase proportionately.
- Increases in value during the past fiscal year can be attributed primarily to (i) significant pent up demand for core property in major, primarily coastal and gateway cities, which accounts for a large portion of CalPERS' real estate portfolio, and which, based on unspent commitments in open end funds and separate accounts, continues to be strong, and (ii) relatively attractive current returns from completed properties compared to other available income-oriented investments. As employment levels continue to increase, it is reasonable to expect increases in rent, occupancy, and many individual property valuations to continue during the next twelve months.
- The same cannot be said for international investments beyond five major cities in the UK and several key capital cities in Continental Europe and Asia. Much volatility and risk continues to be observed in BRIC countries. Negative to slower employment growth, political instability and government policies have been compounded by the adverse exchange rates movements. This is unlikely to



change materially during the next twelve months, and it is possible that valuations will continue to decline.

CalPERS' Real Estate:

- In an illiquid asset class populated with multi-year partnerships, longer-term results are more significant than those of a shorter duration.
- Real Estate underperformed the Policy Benchmark as reported for the quarter ending December 31, 2015. Performance over the one-year period continued the upward trend started in the third quarter of 2010, yielding 15.5%, net of fees. Over the longer term, the real estate program had less favorable results with net returns of 0.7% during the trailing ten-year period. The pacing (dollar allocation timing) of the pre- 2008-09 recession commitments had a very large negative impact on portfolio rates of return versus the Benchmark. These returns were less than the applicable Benchmark returns by 8.4%.

Real Estate Performance	Quarter	1 Year	3 Year	5 Year	10 Year
Real Estate Returns	2.60%	15.50%	13.40%	13.40%	0.70%
Real Estate Policy Benchmark	<u>3.40%</u>	<u>13.90%</u>	<u>12.40%</u>	<u>12.90%</u>	<u>9.10%</u>
Difference	-0.80%	1.60%	1.00%	0.50%	-8.40%

- It has continued to be difficult to put meaningful amounts of money to work at acceptable projected returns consistent with CalPERS' criteria. Enormous amounts of capital have been and continue to be allocated by global investors to commercial real estate investments, particularly for completed and leased assets located in the US and a handful of major international cities in Europe and Asia. The capital sources are varied; it comes from employees' retirement systems and other pension plans, endowments, foundations, sovereign wealth funds, public REITs, insurance companies and high net worth individuals, both as traditional domestic investors and as "flight capital" from outside the US seeking a safer place to land than home. Many of these investors have different missions, liability streams, and return/risk thresholds than CalPERS, which have priced CalPERS out of the market. PCA believes the System's discipline will benefit the fund over the long term. This disparate group of typical buyers have been joined by non-traditional property investors such as hedge funds; public equity investors looking to take "money off the table" and place profits into what is perceived as less volatile assets; and fixed income investors and others for whom the bond market still does not provide an adequate current return. The effect on prices has been material, with many assets' values exceeding the record levels observed before the Great Financial Crisis of 2008-09. PCA again cautions to temper expectations of sustained increases in value when interest rates and new construction starts return to more normalized levels. To their credit, RAU Staff and the investment



managers they supervise have shown discipline in their acquisition efforts, even though there are temptations to reduce yield requirements in order to clear the market and increase the percentage of real estate assets in the overall portfolio.

- As previously articulated, the longer term performance of the real estate portfolio has been hindered by three primary factors:
 - Significant amounts of CalPERS' capital were invested during the 2005 to 2007 period which exposed the portfolio to the risk of vintage-year concentration. The Portfolio now employs more systematic and disciplined approaches toward new capital allocations to managers in order to mitigate this risk;
 - A high proportion of the portfolio was invested for capital appreciation (not current income) in riskier, non-stabilized properties. The Portfolio continues to shift more in the direction of a current income focus, as more capital is deployed in core strategies and less in new opportunistic transactions and the portfolio disposes of non-strategic, Legacy holdings; and
 - High amounts of leverage were employed at the peak of the cycle. More in line with the real estate benchmark, lower levels of debt are being used. In addition, methods to manage the debt are being reviewed to determine whether, and how, CalPERS can more actively reduce debt costs at the portfolio level compared to the individual manager level.
- Non-stabilized, highly leveraged investments exacerbated historical underperformance compared to the benchmark, which is primarily composed of completed and leased properties, during the economic crisis. Non-stabilized assets provide less income to insulate against valuation declines. Increased leverage magnifies positive appreciation returns in upward market cycles, of which CalPERS' portfolio has been the beneficiary during the past six years, and magnifies negative appreciation returns in downward market cycles such as 2008-10.
- In recognition of these characteristics, and in order to more closely align the real estate portfolio with the role of real estate, Staff has disposed of the bulk of the commingled fund limited partnership units (current net asset value: approximately \$3B) which hold interests in these types of assets. These investments were characterized largely as high risk, commingled, closed-end funds, with little or no control over the assets, high fees and vintage years during the height of the last real estate cycle.
- The updated Real Estate Strategic Plan will be presented to the IC in April 2016. The current plan was approved at the February 2011 Investment Committee Meeting. This plan provides for the implementation of the revised role of real estate as reaffirmed in the last asset allocation study. This role is primarily to provide (i) reliable current income and (ii) diversification from public and private equity return characteristics. Therefore, as seen in fiscal year ending June 30, 2015 results, and planned for the next several years, the portfolio will continue to shift in emphasis towards primarily strategic, stabilized, income producing domestic core assets held for a longer term, and away from more tactical, opportunistic, appreciation-oriented investments held for a shorter term.



- The valuation policy for real estate has changed, effective for the fiscal year beginning July 1, 2015. Going forward, investment managers and external appraisers will value real estate assets held in separate accounts on a quarterly basis. The new process will provide better visibility into short-term performance and volatility than the historical valuation policy, in which CalPERS' separate accounts were appraised once annually, as of March 31. Due to the single annual valuation, the performance of the real estate portfolio lagged other indices and the benchmark during the three quarters in which asset values were not marked to market.

PCA is available to take any questions of the Investment Committee.

Respectfully,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "David Glickman".

David Glickman
Managing Director

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Christy Fields".

Christy Fields
Managing Director

DISCLOSURES: This document is provided for informational purposes only. It does not constitute an offer of securities of any of the issuers that may be described herein. Information contained herein may have been provided by third parties, including investment firms providing information on returns and assets under management, and may not have been independently verified. The past performance information contained in this report is not necessarily indicative of future results and there is no assurance that the investment in question will achieve comparable results or that the Firm will be able to implement its investment strategy or achieve its investment objectives. The actual realized value of currently unrealized investments (if any) will depend on a variety of factors, including future operating results, the value of the assets and market conditions at the time of disposition, any related transaction costs and the timing and manner of sale, all of which may differ from the assumptions and circumstances on which any current unrealized valuations are based.

Neither PCA nor PCA's officers, employees or agents, make any representation or warranty, express or implied, in relation to the accuracy or completeness of the information contained in this document or any oral information provided in connection herewith, or any data subsequently generated herefrom, and accept no responsibility, obligation or liability (whether direct or indirect, in contract, tort or otherwise) in relation to any of such information. PCA and PCA's officers, employees and agents expressly disclaim any and all liability that may be based on this document and any errors therein or omissions therefrom. Neither PCA nor any of PCA's officers, employees or agents, make any representation of warranty, express or implied, that any transaction has been or may be effected on the terms or in the manner stated in this document, or as to the achievement or reasonableness of future projections, management targets, estimates, prospects or returns, if any. Any views or terms contained herein are preliminary only, and are based on financial, economic, market and other conditions prevailing as of the date of this document and are therefore subject to change.

The information contained in this report may include forward-looking statements. Forward-looking statements include a number of risks, uncertainties and other factors beyond the control of the Firm, which may result in material differences in actual results, performance or other expectations. The opinions, estimates and analyses reflect PCA's current judgment, which may change in the future.

Any tables, graphs or charts relating to past performance included in this report are intended only to illustrate investment performance for the historical periods shown. Such tables, graphs and charts are not intended to predict future performance and should not be used as the basis for an investment decision.

All trademarks or product names mentioned herein are the property of their respective owners. Indices are unmanaged and one cannot invest directly in an index. The index data provided is on an "as is" basis. In no event shall the index providers or its affiliates have any liability of any kind in connection with the index data or the portfolio described herein. Copying or redistributing the index data is strictly prohibited.

The Russell indices are either registered trademarks or tradenames of Frank Russell Company in the U.S. and/or other countries.

The MSCI indices are trademarks and service marks of MSCI or its subsidiaries.

Standard and Poor's (S&P) is a division of The McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc. S&P indices, including the S&P 500, are a registered trademark of The McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc.

CBOE, not S&P, calculates and disseminates the BXM Index. The CBOE has a business relationship with Standard & Poor's on the BXM. CBOE and Chicago Board Options Exchange are registered trademarks of the CBOE, and SPX, and CBOE S&P 500 BuyWrite Index BXM are servicemarks of the CBOE. The methodology of the CBOE S&P 500 BuyWrite Index is owned by CBOE and may be covered by one or more patents or pending patent applications.

The Barclays Capital indices (formerly known as the Lehman indices) are trademarks of Barclays Capital, Inc.

The Citigroup indices are trademarks of Citicorp or its affiliates.

The Merrill Lynch indices are trademarks of Merrill Lynch & Co. or its affiliates.

Supplement for real estate and private equity partnerships:

While PCA has reviewed the terms of the Fund referred to in this document and other accompanying financial information on predecessor partnerships, this document does not constitute a formal legal review of the partnership terms and other legal documents pertaining to the Fund. PCA recommends that its clients retain separate legal and tax counsel to review the legal and tax aspects and risks of investing in the Fund. Information presented in this report was gathered from documents provided by third party sources, including but not limited to, the private placement memorandum and related updates, due diligence responses, marketing presentations, limited partnership agreement and other supplemental materials. Analysis of information was performed by PCA.

An investment in the Fund is speculative and involves a degree of risk and no assurance can be provided that the investment objectives of the Fund will be achieved. Investment in the Fund is suitable only for sophisticated investors who are in a position to tolerate such risk and satisfy themselves that such investment is appropriate for them. The Fund may lack diversification, thereby increasing the risk of loss, and the Fund's performance may be volatile. As a result, an investor could lose all or a substantial amount of its investment. The Fund's governing documents will contain descriptions of certain of the risks associated with an investment in the Fund. In addition, the Fund's fees and expenses may offset its profits. It is unlikely that there will be a secondary market for the shares. There are restrictions on redeeming and transferring shares of the Fund. In making an investment decision, you must rely on your own examination of the Fund and the terms of the offering.