



Agenda Item 7d

March 17, 2015

ITEM NAME: Revised Request for Proposal (RFP) - Parallel Actuarial Valuation Services

PROGRAM: Audit Services

ITEM TYPE: Action

RECOMMENDATION

Approve the release of a revised RFP seeking an external firm to provide parallel actuarial valuation and certification services to the Board of Administration (Board).

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The CalPERS Board has delegated to the Risk and Audit Committee the authority to approve and oversee actuarial audits and reinsurance and conduct the selection of the Board's independent actuary for performing parallel valuations.

The purpose of this agenda item is to request approval of a revised RFP seeking an external firm through a competitive bidding process to provide parallel actuarial valuation and certification services to the Board. The selected firm will provide parallel valuation and certification for annual valuations of contracting public agency pension plans, the state and schools pension plans, Judges' Retirement System (JRS), Judges' Retirement System II (JRSII), Legislators' Retirement System (LRS) and 1959 Survivors Benefit Program (SBP).

On September 16, 2014, the Risk and Audit Committee approved the release of the original RFP, including Services to be Provided, Minimum Qualifications, Proposal Evaluation Process, and Proposal Evaluation Sheet. While Minimum Qualifications remain unchanged (Attachment 1), the revised RFP modified the scoring methodology reflected in the Revised Proposal Evaluation Process (Attachment 2) and Revised Proposal Evaluation Sheet (Attachment 3). In addition, it modified the valuation and certification completion dates specified in the Services to be Provided (Attachment 4).

STRATEGIC PLAN

This agenda item supports Strategic Plan Goal A - improve long-term pension and health benefit sustainability. The selected firm will provide reinsurance that the liabilities and costs computed by the Board's professional actuarial staff are reasonably accurate and are computed in accordance with generally accepted actuarial principles.

BACKGROUND

Under the California Constitution, the Board has plenary authority and fiduciary responsibility to provide for actuarial services. The CalPERS Chief Actuary advises the Board and directs the activities of the CalPERS professional actuarial staff. The Board also retains the services of an outside actuarial firm to review the work of the CalPERS actuarial staff and to certify that such work satisfies actuarial professional standards. The current contract with Cheiron, Inc. (2009-5377, A#3) expired on February 28, 2015. On September 16, 2014, we requested and obtained approval to initiate an RFP for a new contract for continuation of these services scheduled to begin on November 1, 2015 and end on October 31, 2020.

The RFP was originally released in December 2014 but subsequently cancelled, so we could review and update the scoring methodology that better meets the needs of the full Board. During the review, we also updated the valuation and certification completion dates specified in the Services to be Provided.

ANALYSIS

Prior to September 2014's request for the release of the RFP, we examined the following three alternatives:

- Alternative 1 - Do not continue to seek parallel valuation services.
- Alternative 2 - Assign internal audit staff to perform the reviews.
- Alternative 3 - Hire an external firm to perform the reviews.

Alternative 1: We do not recommend alternative 1 because the existing contract has expired, and the Board will not have the reassurance needed to fulfill its fiduciary responsibilities to ensure accuracy of the complex and crucial actuarial valuation calculations.

Alternative 2: We do not recommend alternative 2 because Government Code Section 13886.5(a) requires state agencies that have their own internal auditors to conduct internal audit activity in accordance with standards prescribed by the Institute of Internal Auditors. *International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing* (Standards) prescribed by the Institute of Internal Auditors require internal auditors to possess the knowledge and skills needed to perform their individual responsibilities. The Standards also require the Chief Auditor to obtain competent advice and assistance if the internal auditors lack the knowledge and skills needed to perform all or part of the engagement. Currently, Office of Audit Services does not have staff with pension or health actuarial valuation experience. Therefore, alternative 2 will cause non-compliance with the Government Code Section 13886.5(a) and the Standards.

Alternative 3: Staff recommends the Board hire an external firm with appropriate expertise to provide the parallel valuation and certification services. This alternative enables the Board to receive appropriate reassurance needed to fulfill its fiduciary

responsibilities and Office of Audit Services to comply with the Government Code Section 13886.5(a) and the Standards.

Upon approval of the revised RFP, staff will release the revised RFP through a competitive bidding process on April 1, 2015. Upon receipt of the proposals, firms will be assessed against a robust Minimum Qualifications review. Firms that have satisfied the Minimum Qualifications will follow the process described in the Proposal Evaluation Process and advance to the Technical Proposal Evaluation phase, where staff will evaluate the proposals and may receive guidance and oversight from two members of the Risk and Audit Committee. Proposals that pass the Technical Proposal Evaluation will advance to the Fee Proposal Evaluation phase. Once staff scores the Fee Proposals, the Board will determine the finalists who will be interviewed by the Risk and Audit Committee.

The Risk and Audit Committee will conduct oral interviews of the finalists and score proposals as detailed in the Proposal Evaluation Process. At a subsequent Board meeting, the Board will award the contract to the candidate receiving the highest overall score, and the Notice of Award will be issued.

BUDGET AND FISCAL IMPACTS

Total costs for the existing five-year contract ending on February 28, 2015 are \$383,117. Total costs for the new contract, covering another five-year term from November 1, 2015 to October 31, 2020, are to be negotiated.

BENEFITS/RISKS

Benefits of Alternative 3 include the following:

- Provide the Board with independent reassurance that the liabilities and costs computed by CalPERS professional actuarial staff are reasonably accurate and are computed in accordance with generally accepted actuarial principles.
- Ensure compliance with the Government Code Section 13886.5(a) and Standards.

Risks of Alternative 3 include the following:

- CalPERS continues to rely on external firms to perform actuarial reassurance activities and does not promote knowledge transfer to internal staff. However, because actuarial knowledge, skills, and credentials are highly specialized, and these specialized professional skills are only needed for intermittent, limited durations throughout the contract period, it is advisable to engage an outside specialist, rather than hire full time actuarial auditors on state staff.

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 – “Minimum Qualifications” approved on September 16, 2014

Attachment 2 – Revised Proposal Evaluation Process

Attachment 3 – Revised Proposal Evaluation Sheet

Attachment 4 – Revised Services to be Provided

YOUNG HAMILTON, Acting Chief
Office of Audit Services

MATTHEW G. JACOBS
General Counsel

DOUGLAS HOFFNER
Deputy Executive Officer
Operations and Technology

ALAN MILLIGAN
Chief Actuary