



**Date:** January 21, 2015

**To:** Members of the Investment Committee  
California Public Employees' Retirement System

**From:** Pension Consulting Alliance, Inc. (PCA)

**RE:** Real Estate Performance through September 30, 2014

PCA received and reviewed Wilshire's Executive Summary of CalPERS' Investment Performance for the period ending September 30, 2014 as it relates to the Real Estate Portfolio. The following items should be considered in your assessment of Real Estate's performance:

- In an illiquid asset class populated with multi-year partnerships, longer term results are more significant than those of a shorter duration.
- Real Estate underperformed the benchmark as reported for the quarter ending September 30, 2014. Performance over the one-year period continued the upward trend started in the third quarter of 2010, yielding 13.1% net of fees. Over the longer term, the real estate program had less favorable results with net returns of 9.1% and 2.4% during the trailing five- and ten-year periods, respectively. These returns were less than the applicable benchmark returns by 2.9% and 7.2%, respectively.

Real Estate Performance	Quarter	1 Year	3 Year	5 Year	10 Year
Real Estate Returns	0.8%	13.1%	13.4%	9.1%	2.4%
Real Estate Policy Benchmark	<u>3.0%</u>	<u>11.4%</u>	<u>11.7%</u>	<u>12.0%</u>	<u>9.6%</u>
Difference	-2.2%	1.7%	1.7%	-2.9%	-7.2%

- New construction remains relatively disciplined in retail, office, industrial and hotel sectors. Apartment and condominium starts continue to trend up towards historical average annual levels.
- It has been difficult to put money to work at acceptable risk-adjusted projected returns consistent with CalPERS' criteria. Enormous amounts of capital have been and continue to be allocated by global investors to commercial real estate investments, particularly for completed and leased assets located in the US and a handful of major international cities in Europe and Asia. The capital is ecumenical: it comes from employees' retirement systems and other pension plans, endowments, foundations, sovereign wealth funds, public REITs, insurance companies and high net worth individuals, both as traditional domestic investments and as "flight capital" seeking a safer place to land than home. These investors, many of whom have different thresholds than CalPERS to describe acceptable risk adjusted returns, have been joined by non-traditional



property investors such as hedge funds, equity investors looking to take “money off the table” and place profits into what is perceived as less volatile assets; and fixed income investors and others for whom the bond market does not provide an adequate current return. The effect on prices has been material, with many assets’ values exceeding the record levels observed before the Great Financial Crisis of 2008-09. PCA cautions “to not confuse brains with a bull market” in expecting these increases in value to be sustained when interest rates and new construction starts return to more normalized levels.

- As previously articulated, the longer term performance of the real estate portfolio has been hindered by three primary factors:
  - Significant amounts of CalPERS’ capital were invested during the 2005 to 2007 period which exposed the portfolio to the risk of vintage-year concentration. The Portfolio continues to employ more systematic and disciplined approaches toward new capital allocations to managers in order to mitigate this risk;
  - A high proportion of the portfolio was invested for capital appreciation (not current income) in riskier, non-stabilized properties. The Portfolio continues to shift more in the direction of a current income focus, as more capital is deployed in core strategies, and less in new opportunistic transactions; and
  - High amounts of leverage were employed at the peak of the cycle. More in line with the real estate benchmark, lower levels of debt are being used. In addition, methods to manage the debt are being reviewed to determine whether, and how, CalPERS can more actively reduce debt costs at the portfolio level compared to the individual manager level.
- Non-stabilized, highly leveraged investments exacerbated historical underperformance compared to the benchmark, which is primarily composed of completed and leased properties, during the economic crisis. Non-stabilized assets provide less income to insulate against valuation declines. Increased leverage magnifies positive appreciation returns in upward market cycles, of which CalPERS’ portfolio has been the beneficiary during the past two years, and magnifies negative appreciation returns in downward market cycles such as 2008-10.
- The current Real Estate Strategic Plan was approved at the February 2011 Investment Committee meeting. This plan provides for the implementation of the revised role of real estate as re-iterated in the most recent asset allocation study. This role is primarily to provide (i) reliable current income and (ii) diversification from public and private equity return characteristics. Therefore, as seen in this year’s results, and planned for the next several years, the portfolio will continue to shift in emphasis towards primarily strategic, stabilized, income producing domestic core assets held for a longer term, and away from more tactical, opportunistic, appreciation-oriented investments held for a shorter term.
- In general, the global commercial real estate markets continue to display improving fundamentals insofar as occupancy demand and increases in net rental rates; however, these rates of increase are still relatively mild. The risks associated with this slower pace are partially mitigated by below average new



construction levels (except for multifamily residential) and historically low base rates for mortgage loans. Increases in value during the past year can be attributed primarily to (i) pent up demand for core property in major, primarily coastal and capital cities and (ii) relatively attractive current returns from completed properties compared to other available income-oriented investments. As employment increases, uncertainties about domestic economic trends and political instability are declining, it is reasonable to expect increases in rent, occupancy, and many valuations to continue during the next twelve months.

Note: PCA does not believe any single quarter's reported performance relative to the benchmark is informative since the benchmark includes properties appraised ratably throughout a twelve month period, and CalPERS' current appraisal policy (which is being reviewed) provides for annual appraisals. The impact of the CalPERS appraisals is primarily incorporated into the results reported for the quarter ending June 30 (some commingled funds report appreciation/depreciation as valued by appraisers or general partners at other times). In other words, all else equal, compared to the portion of the benchmark relating to private real estate, PCA expects significantly more of a year's reported appreciation/depreciation in values to be concentrated in the quarter ending June 30, based on values recorded in the January through March quarter, and somewhat less to be recorded in CalPERS' results in the other three quarters.

PCA is available to take any questions of the Investment Committee.

Respectfully,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "David Glickman".

David Glickman  
Managing Director

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Dillon Lord".

Dillon Lord  
Principal



**DISCLOSURES:** This document is provided for informational purposes only. It does not constitute an offer of securities of any of the issuers that may be described herein. Information contained herein may have been provided by third parties, including investment firms providing information on returns and assets under management, and may not have been independently verified. The past performance information contained in this report is not necessarily indicative of future results and there is no assurance that the investment in question will achieve comparable results or that the Firm will be able to implement its investment strategy or achieve its investment objectives. The actual realized value of currently unrealized investments (if any) will depend on a variety of factors, including future operating results, the value of the assets and market conditions at the time of disposition, any related transaction costs and the timing and manner of sale, all of which may differ from the assumptions and circumstances on which any current unrealized valuations are based.

Neither PCA nor PCA's officers, employees or agents, make any representation or warranty, express or implied, in relation to the accuracy or completeness of the information contained in this document or any oral information provided in connection herewith, or any data subsequently generated herefrom, and accept no responsibility, obligation or liability (whether direct or indirect, in contract, tort or otherwise) in relation to any of such information. PCA and PCA's officers, employees and agents expressly disclaim any and all liability that may be based on this document and any errors therein or omissions therefrom. Neither PCA nor any of PCA's officers, employees or agents, make any representation of warranty, express or implied, that any transaction has been or may be effected on the terms or in the manner stated in this document, or as to the achievement or reasonableness of future projections, management targets, estimates, prospects or returns, if any. Any views or terms contained herein are preliminary only, and are based on financial, economic, market and other conditions prevailing as of the date of this document and are therefore subject to change.

The information contained in this report may include forward-looking statements. Forward-looking statements include a number of risks, uncertainties and other factors beyond the control of the Firm, which may result in material differences in actual results, performance or other expectations. The opinions, estimates and analyses reflect PCA's current judgment, which may change in the future.

Any tables, graphs or charts relating to past performance included in this report are intended only to illustrate investment performance for the historical periods shown. Such tables, graphs and charts are not intended to predict future performance and should not be used as the basis for an investment decision.

All trademarks or product names mentioned herein are the property of their respective owners. Indices are unmanaged and one cannot invest directly in an index. The index data provided is on an "as is" basis. In no event shall the index providers or its affiliates have any liability of any kind in connection with the index data or the portfolio described herein. Copying or redistributing the index data is strictly prohibited.

The Russell indices are either registered trademarks or tradenames of Frank Russell Company in the U.S. and/or other countries.

The MSCI indices are trademarks and service marks of MSCI or its subsidiaries.

Standard and Poor's (S&P) is a division of The McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc. S&P indices, including the S&P 500, are a registered trademark of The McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc.

CBOE, not S&P, calculates and disseminates the BXM Index. The CBOE has a business relationship with Standard & Poor's on the BXM. CBOE and Chicago Board Options Exchange are registered trademarks of the CBOE, and SPX, and CBOE S&P 500 BuyWrite Index BXM are servicemarks of the CBOE. The methodology of the CBOE S&P 500 BuyWrite Index is owned by CBOE and may be covered by one or more patents or pending patent applications.

The Barclays Capital indices (formerly known as the Lehman indices) are trademarks of Barclays Capital, Inc.

The Citigroup indices are trademarks of Citicorp or its affiliates.

The Merrill Lynch indices are trademarks of Merrill Lynch & Co. or its affiliates.

**Supplement for real estate and private equity partnerships:**

While PCA has reviewed the terms of the Fund referred to in this document and other accompanying financial information on predecessor partnerships, this document does not constitute a formal legal review of the partnership terms and other legal documents pertaining to the Fund. PCA recommends that its clients retain separate legal and tax counsel to review the legal and tax aspects and risks of investing in the Fund. Information presented in this report was gathered from documents provided by third party sources, including but not limited to, the private placement memorandum and related updates, due diligence responses, marketing presentations, limited partnership agreement and other supplemental materials. Analysis of information was performed by PCA.

An investment in the Fund is speculative and involves a degree of risk and no assurance can be provided that the investment objectives of the Fund will be achieved. Investment in the Fund is suitable only for sophisticated investors who are in a position to tolerate such risk and satisfy themselves that such investment is appropriate for them. The Fund may lack diversification, thereby increasing the risk of loss, and the Fund's performance may be volatile. As a result, an investor could lose all or a substantial amount of its investment. The Fund's governing documents will contain descriptions of certain of the risks associated with an investment in the Fund. In addition, the Fund's fees and expenses may offset its profits. It is unlikely that there will be a secondary market for the shares. There are restrictions on redeeming and transferring shares of the Fund. In making an investment decision, you must rely on your own examination of the Fund and the terms of the offering.